

Appendix F.1
Species List: Monarch Butterfly



United States Department of the Interior

FISH AND WILDLIFE SERVICE
Long Island Ecological Services Field Office
340 Smith Road
Shirley, NY 11967-2258
Phone: (631) 286-0485 Fax: (631) 286-4003



In Reply Refer To:

09/03/2024 00:36:49 UTC

Project Code: 2024-0138314

Project Name: Fulton Elliott-Chelsea Development Project

Subject: List of threatened and endangered species that may occur in your proposed project location or may be affected by your proposed project

To Whom It May Concern:

The enclosed species list identifies threatened, endangered, proposed, and candidate species, as well as proposed and final designated critical habitat, that may occur within the boundary of your proposed project and/or may be affected by your proposed project. The species list fulfills the requirements of the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (Service) under section 7(c) of the Endangered Species Act (Act) of 1973, as amended (16 U.S.C. 1531 *et seq.*).

New information based on updated surveys, changes in the abundance and distribution of species, changed habitat conditions, or other factors could change this list. Please feel free to contact us if you need more current information or assistance regarding the potential impacts to federally proposed, listed, and candidate species and federally designated and proposed critical habitat. Please note that under 50 CFR 402.12(e) of the regulations implementing section 7 of the Act, the accuracy of this species list should be verified after 90 days. This verification can be completed formally or informally as desired. The Service recommends that verification be completed by visiting the IPaC website at regular intervals during project planning and implementation for updates to species lists and information. An updated list may be requested through IPaC by completing the same process used to receive the enclosed list.

The purpose of the Act is to provide a means whereby threatened and endangered species and the ecosystems upon which they depend may be conserved. Under sections 7(a)(1) and 7(a)(2) of the Act and its implementing regulations (50 CFR 402 *et seq.*), Federal agencies are required to utilize their authorities to carry out programs for the conservation of threatened and endangered species and to determine whether projects may affect threatened and endangered species and/or designated critical habitat.

A Biological Assessment is required for construction projects (or other undertakings having similar physical impacts) that are major Federal actions significantly affecting the quality of the human environment as defined in the National Environmental Policy Act (42 U.S.C. 4332(2) (c)). For projects other than major construction activities, the Service suggests that a biological

evaluation similar to a Biological Assessment be prepared to determine whether the project may affect listed or proposed species and/or designated or proposed critical habitat. Recommended contents of a Biological Assessment are described at 50 CFR 402.12.

If a Federal agency determines, based on the Biological Assessment or biological evaluation, that listed species and/or designated critical habitat may be affected by the proposed project, the agency is required to consult with the Service pursuant to 50 CFR 402. In addition, the Service recommends that candidate species, proposed species and proposed critical habitat be addressed within the consultation. More information on the regulations and procedures for section 7 consultation, including the role of permit or license applicants, can be found in the "Endangered Species Consultation Handbook" at: <https://www.fws.gov/sites/default/files/documents/endangered-species-consultation-handbook.pdf>

Migratory Birds: In addition to responsibilities to protect threatened and endangered species under the Endangered Species Act (ESA), there are additional responsibilities under the Migratory Bird Treaty Act (MBTA) and the Bald and Golden Eagle Protection Act (BGEPA) to protect native birds from project-related impacts. Any activity, intentional or unintentional, resulting in take of migratory birds, including eagles, is prohibited unless otherwise permitted by the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (50 C.F.R. Sec. 10.12 and 16 U.S.C. Sec. 668(a)). For more information regarding these Acts, see [Migratory Bird Permit | What We Do | U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service \(fws.gov\)](#).

The MBTA has no provision for allowing take of migratory birds that may be unintentionally killed or injured by otherwise lawful activities. It is the responsibility of the project proponent to comply with these Acts by identifying potential impacts to migratory birds and eagles within applicable NEPA documents (when there is a federal nexus) or a Bird/Eagle Conservation Plan (when there is no federal nexus). Proponents should implement conservation measures to avoid or minimize the production of project-related stressors or minimize the exposure of birds and their resources to the project-related stressors. For more information on avian stressors and recommended conservation measures, see <https://www.fws.gov/library/collections/threats-birds>.

In addition to MBTA and BGEPA, Executive Order 13186: *Responsibilities of Federal Agencies to Protect Migratory Birds*, obligates all Federal agencies that engage in or authorize activities that might affect migratory birds, to minimize those effects and encourage conservation measures that will improve bird populations. Executive Order 13186 provides for the protection of both migratory birds and migratory bird habitat. For information regarding the implementation of Executive Order 13186, please visit <https://www.fws.gov/partner/council-conservation-migratory-birds>.

We appreciate your concern for threatened and endangered species. The Service encourages Federal agencies to include conservation of threatened and endangered species into their project planning to further the purposes of the Act. Please include the Consultation Code in the header of this letter with any request for consultation or correspondence about your project that you submit to our office.

Attachment(s):

- Official Species List

OFFICIAL SPECIES LIST

This list is provided pursuant to Section 7 of the Endangered Species Act, and fulfills the requirement for Federal agencies to "request of the Secretary of the Interior information whether any species which is listed or proposed to be listed may be present in the area of a proposed action".

This species list is provided by:

Long Island Ecological Services Field Office

340 Smith Road

Shirley, NY 11967-2258

(631) 286-0485

PROJECT SUMMARY

Project Code: 2024-0138314

Project Name: Fulton Elliott-Chelsea Development Project

Project Type: Mixed-Use Construction

Project Description: The project contemplates the following activities (collectively, the “Proposed Project”):

- a) The complete replacement of existing buildings known as Fulton Houses, Elliott Houses, Chelsea Houses, and Chelsea Addition Houses on two New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA) campuses in the Chelsea neighborhood of Manhattan (collectively, the “Project Sites”); and
- b) The development of new mixed-use buildings on the Project Sites, which would create additional market rate and affordable residential units, expand community facility space (including new health care and childcare facilities), and new retail and supermarket uses intended to cater specifically to healthy grocer needs.

Project Location:

The approximate location of the project can be viewed in Google Maps: <https://www.google.com/maps/@40.7492084,-74.00185207687935,14z>



Counties: New York County, New York

ENDANGERED SPECIES ACT SPECIES

There is a total of 1 threatened, endangered, or candidate species on this species list.

Species on this list should be considered in an effects analysis for your project and could include species that exist in another geographic area. For example, certain fish may appear on the species list because a project could affect downstream species.

IPaC does not display listed species or critical habitats under the sole jurisdiction of NOAA Fisheries¹, as USFWS does not have the authority to speak on behalf of NOAA and the Department of Commerce.

See the "Critical habitats" section below for those critical habitats that lie wholly or partially within your project area under this office's jurisdiction. Please contact the designated FWS office if you have questions.

-
1. [NOAA Fisheries](#), also known as the National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS), is an office of the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration within the Department of Commerce.

INSECTS

NAME	STATUS
Monarch Butterfly <i>Danaus plexippus</i> No critical habitat has been designated for this species. Species profile: https://ecos.fws.gov/ecp/species/9743	Candidate

CRITICAL HABITATS

THERE ARE NO CRITICAL HABITATS WITHIN YOUR PROJECT AREA UNDER THIS OFFICE'S JURISDICTION.

YOU ARE STILL REQUIRED TO DETERMINE IF YOUR PROJECT(S) MAY HAVE EFFECTS ON ALL ABOVE LISTED SPECIES.

IPAC USER CONTACT INFORMATION

Agency: Private Entity
Name: Jeff Reuben
Address: 432 Park Av South, 6th floor
City: New York
State: NY
Zip: 10016
Email: jreuben@phaeng.com
Phone: 9172826478

LEAD AGENCY CONTACT INFORMATION

Lead Agency: New York city

Appendix F.2
“No Effect” Determination on the Northern Long Eared Bat



United States Department of the Interior

FISH AND WILDLIFE SERVICE
Long Island Ecological Services Field Office
340 Smith Road
Shirley, NY 11967-2258
Phone: (631) 286-0485 Fax: (631) 286-4003



In Reply Refer To:
Project code: 2024-0005542
Project Name: Fulton Elliott-Chelsea Redevelopment Project

October 17, 2023

Federal Nexus: yes
Federal Action Agency (if applicable): New York city

Subject: Record of project representative's no effect determination for 'Fulton Elliott-Chelsea Redevelopment Project'

Dear Jeff Reuben:

This letter records your determination using the Information for Planning and Consultation (IPaC) system provided to the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (Service) on October 17, 2023, for 'Fulton Elliott-Chelsea Redevelopment Project' (here forward, Project). This project has been assigned Project Code 2024-0005542 and all future correspondence should clearly reference this number. **Please carefully review this letter.**

Ensuring Accurate Determinations When Using IPaC

The Service developed the IPaC system and associated species' determination keys in accordance with the Endangered Species Act of 1973 (ESA; 87 Stat. 884, as amended; 16 U.S.C. 1531 et seq.) and based on a standing analysis. All information submitted by the Project proponent into IPaC must accurately represent the full scope and details of the Project.

Failure to accurately represent or implement the Project as detailed in IPaC or the Northern Long-eared Bat Rangewide Determination Key (Dkey), invalidates this letter. ***Answers to certain questions in the DKey commit the project proponent to implementation of conservation measures that must be followed for the ESA determination to remain valid.***

Determination for the Northern Long-Eared Bat

Based upon your IPaC submission and a standing analysis, your project has reached the determination of "No Effect" on the northern long-eared bat. To make a no effect determination, the full scope of the proposed project implementation (action) should not have any effects (either positive or negative), to a federally listed species or designated critical habitat. Effects of the action are all consequences to listed species or critical habitat that are caused by the proposed

action, including the consequences of other activities that are caused by the proposed action. A consequence is caused by the proposed action if it would not occur but for the proposed action and it is reasonably certain to occur. Effects of the action may occur later in time and may include consequences occurring outside the immediate area involved in the action. (See § 402.17).

Under Section 7 of the ESA, if a federal action agency makes a no effect determination, no consultation with the Service is required (ESA §7). If a proposed Federal action may affect a listed species or designated critical habitat, formal consultation is required except when the Service concurs, in writing, that a proposed action "is not likely to adversely affect" listed species or designated critical habitat [50 CFR §402.02, 50 CFR§402.13].

Other Species and Critical Habitat that May be Present in the Action Area

The IPaC-assisted determination for the northern long-eared bat does not apply to the following ESA-protected species and/or critical habitat that also may occur in your Action area:

- Monarch Butterfly *Danaus plexippus* Candidate

You may coordinate with our Office to determine whether the Action may affect the animal species listed above and, if so, how they may be affected.

Next Steps

Based upon your IPaC submission, your project has reached the determination of “No Effect” on the northern long-eared bat. If there are no updates on listed species, no further consultation/coordination for this project is required with respect to the northern long-eared bat. However, the Service recommends that project proponents re-evaluate the Project in IPaC if: 1) the scope, timing, duration, or location of the Project changes (includes any project changes or amendments); 2) new information reveals the Project may impact (positively or negatively) federally listed species or designated critical habitat; or 3) a new species is listed, or critical habitat designated. If any of the above conditions occurs, additional coordination with the Service should take place to ensure compliance with the Act.

If you have any questions regarding this letter or need further assistance, please contact the Long Island Ecological Services Field Office and reference Project Code 2024-0005542 associated with this Project.

Action Description

You provided to IPaC the following name and description for the subject Action.

1. Name

Fulton Elliott-Chelsea Redevelopment Project

2. Description

The following description was provided for the project 'Fulton Elliott-Chelsea Redevelopment Project':

The project contemplates the following activities (collectively, the “Proposed Project”):

- a) The complete replacement of existing buildings known as Fulton Houses, Elliott Houses, Chelsea Houses, and Chelsea Addition Houses on two New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA) campuses in the Chelsea neighborhood of Manhattan (collectively, the “Project Sites”); and
- b) The development of new mixed-use buildings on the Project Sites, which would create additional market rate and affordable residential units, expand community facility space (including new health care and childcare facilities), and new retail and supermarket uses intended to cater specifically to healthy grocer needs.

The approximate location of the project can be viewed in Google Maps: <https://www.google.com/maps/@40.74348705,-74.00462738603103,14z>



DETERMINATION KEY RESULT

Based on the information you provided, you have determined that the Proposed Action will have no effect on the Endangered northern long-eared bat (*Myotis septentrionalis*). Therefore, no consultation with the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service pursuant to Section 7(a)(2) of the Endangered Species Act of 1973 (87 Stat. 884, as amended 16 U.S.C. 1531 *et seq.*) is required for those species.

QUALIFICATION INTERVIEW

1. Does the proposed project include, or is it reasonably certain to cause, intentional take of the northern long-eared bat or any other listed species?

Note: Intentional take is defined as take that is the intended result of a project. Intentional take could refer to research, direct species management, surveys, and/or studies that include intentional handling/encountering, harassment, collection, or capturing of any individual of a federally listed threatened, endangered or proposed species?

No

2. The action area does not overlap with an area for which U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service currently has data to support the presumption that the northern long-eared bat is present. Are you aware of other data that indicates that northern long-eared bats (NLEB) are likely to be present in the action area?

Bat occurrence data may include identification of NLEBs in hibernacula, capture of NLEBs, tracking of NLEBs to roost trees, or confirmed NLEB acoustic detections. Data on captures, roost tree use, and acoustic detections should post-date the year when white-nose syndrome was detected in the relevant state. With this question, we are looking for data that, for some reason, may have not yet been made available to U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service.

No

3. Does any component of the action involve construction or operation of wind turbines?

Note: For federal actions, answer 'yes' if the construction or operation of wind power facilities is either (1) part of the federal action or (2) would not occur but for a federal agency action (federal permit, funding, etc.).

No

4. Is the proposed action authorized, permitted, licensed, funded, or being carried out by a Federal agency in whole or in part?

Yes

5. Is the Federal Highway Administration (FHWA), Federal Railroad Administration (FRA), or Federal Transit Administration (FTA) funding or authorizing the proposed action, in whole or in part?

No

6. Are you an employee of the federal action agency or have you been officially designated in writing by the agency as its designated non-federal representative for the purposes of Endangered Species Act Section 7 informal consultation per 50 CFR § 402.08?

Note: This key may be used for federal actions and for non-federal actions to facilitate section 7 consultation and to help determine whether an incidental take permit may be needed, respectively. This question is for information purposes only.

No

7. Is the lead federal action agency the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) or Federal Communications Commission (FCC)? Is the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) or Federal Communications Commission (FCC) funding or authorizing the proposed action, in whole or in part?

No

8. Is the lead federal action agency the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission (FERC)?

No

9. Have you determined that your proposed action will have no effect on the northern long-eared bat? Remember to consider the [effects of any activities](#) that would not occur but for the proposed action.

If you think that the northern long-eared bat may be affected by your project or if you would like assistance in deciding, answer “No” below and continue through the key. If you have determined that the northern long-eared bat does not occur in your project’s action area and/or that your project will have no effects whatsoever on the species despite the potential for it to occur in the action area, you may make a “no effect” determination for the northern long-eared bat.

Note: Federal agencies (or their designated non-federal representatives) must consult with USFWS on federal agency actions that may affect listed species [50 CFR 402.14(a)]. Consultation is not required for actions that will not affect listed species or critical habitat. Therefore, this determination key will not provide a consistency or verification letter for actions that will not affect listed species. If you believe that the northern long-eared bat may be affected by your project or if you would like assistance in deciding, please answer “No” and continue through the key. Remember that this key addresses only effects to the northern long-eared bat. Consultation with USFWS would be required if your action may affect another listed species or critical habitat. The definition of [Effects of the Action](#) can be found here: <https://www.fws.gov/media/northern-long-eared-bat-assisted-determination-key-selected-definitions>

No

10. Have you contacted the appropriate agency to determine if your action is near any known northern long-eared bat hibernacula?

Note: A document with links to Natural Heritage Inventory databases and other state-specific sources of information on the locations of northern long-eared bat hibernacula is available [here](#). Location information for northern long-eared bat hibernacula is generally kept in state natural heritage inventory databases – the availability of this data varies by state. Many states provide online access to their data, either directly by providing maps or by providing the opportunity to make a data request. In some cases, to protect those resources, access to the information may be limited.

Yes

11. Is any portion of the action area within 0.5-mile radius of any known northern long-eared bat hibernacula? If unsure, contact your local Ecological Services Field Office.

No

12. Does the action area contain any caves (or associated sinkholes, fissures, or other karst features), mines, rocky outcroppings, or tunnels that could provide habitat for hibernating northern long-eared bats?

No

13. Is suitable summer habitat for the northern long-eared bat present within 1000 feet of project activities?
(If unsure, answer "Yes.")

Note: If there are trees within the action area that are of a sufficient size to be potential roosts for bats (i.e., live trees and/or snags ≥ 3 inches (12.7 centimeter) dbh), answer "Yes". If unsure, additional information defining suitable summer habitat for the northern long-eared bat can be found at: <https://www.fws.gov/media/northern-long-eared-bat-assisted-determination-key-selected-definitions>

No

PROJECT QUESTIONNAIRE

Will all project activities be completed by April 1, 2024?

No

IPAC USER CONTACT INFORMATION

Agency: PHA
Name: Jeff Reuben
Address: 432 Park Ave. South, 6th floor
City: New York
State: NY
Zip: 10016
Email: jreuben@phaeng.com
Phone: 2129295656

LEAD AGENCY CONTACT INFORMATION

Lead Agency: New York city
